

Review Form Response

Review FOSS4G Academic Track Submission

This form is for reviewing a FOSS4G Academic Track Submission.

Remarks to the editors *

Even if this paper is really interesting and well written, I have rejected this contribution because it appears clearly out of scope.

Remarks to the author

This paper is about the benchmarking of different graphic APIs for use of cartographic rendering.

This contribution is well written and very interesting, making it a good paper.

For me it falls in the theme:
Architectures and frameworks for open source software and data.

However, I see a problem in this contribution: It does not consider Open Source solutions. It focuses on benchmarking different proprietary solutions (DirectX, GDI) using a proprietary programming language (C#). Therefore it is not in the scope of this Cfp.

Specific comments:

1. Page 8: Why the authors are only working with vector data and do not consider raster data? This can be also interesting to compare the performance of those APIs when rendering raster data.
2. Page 9, last paragraph: When talking about disk IO, why the authors have not considered SSD drives and only HDD? Would be interesting to compare these two solutions.
3. Page 9, last sentence: "The bottleneck was found...", why the authors have considered only shape file? It is known that SHP is not really efficient. Instead file geodatabase appears as an interesting format. See <http://www.josis.org/index.php/josis/article/view/112>
4. Page 11, last paragraph: Please explain why you have made ten runs for each API.
5. In section 7 - Discussion: it would be good to discuss/compare your results with existing solutions implemented in GIS software (QGIS, uDig, ArcMap). It would be also nice for the reader to know if this methodology can be applicable in other context (benchmarking raster data, ...). Finally a figure summarising the different steps of analysis would be nice to have.

Recommendation *

- Strong Accept and recommendation for inclusion in Transactions in GIS
- Strong Accept
- Weak Accept
- Reject

Close

* Denotes required field

