

Review Form Response

Review FOSS4G Academic Track Submission

This form is for reviewing a FOSS4G Academic Track Submission.

Remarks to the editors *

The paper presents an overview of various tools and frameworks that are commonly used when building PGIS solution. The overview is not comprehensive and as authors wrote: The proposed literature review is not meant to be exhaustive. It is rather intended to point out few, significant case studies with the purpose of demonstrating PGIS technical key changes as a consequence of Web 2.0 revolution. The original input is limited to the description of the software solution that can be used on mobile devices to gather data from the field (photos with some descriptive attributes including location) and present the data collected on the web. The solution was build with the use of Open Data Kit, PostgreSQL + PostGIS, OpenLayers, GeoServer.

The authors in some cases did not refrain from the use of populist language ("the focus is placed on the current most valuable tools...", "the study strongly demonstrated the applicability of FOSS technologies for ...") and describing obvious facts (about road pavement damages: "These phenomena occur as a consequence of multiple inducing factors, e.g. concentrated loads due to vehicles transit, usury, physico-chemical agents and thermal expansion.") what decreased the quality of the paper.

The scope of the paper fits well to the scope of the FOSS4G conference, but the writing style and the content is not suitable for a journal publication

Remarks to the author

The paper presents an overview of various tools and frameworks that are commonly used when building PGIS solution. The overview is not comprehensive and as authors wrote: The proposed literature review is not meant to be exhaustive. It is rather intended to point out few, significant case studies with the purpose of demonstrating PGIS technical key changes as a consequence of Web 2.0 revolution. The original input is limited to the description of the software solution that can be used on mobile devices to gather data from the field (photos with some descriptive attributes including location) and present the data collected on the web. The solution was build with the use of Open Data Kit, PostgreSQL + PostGIS, OpenLayers, GeoServer.

The authors in some cases did not refrain from the use of populist language ("the focus is placed on the current most valuable tools...", "the study strongly demonstrated the applicability of FOSS technologies for ...") and describing obvious facts (about road pavement damages: "These phenomena occur as a consequence of multiple inducing factors, e.g. concentrated loads due to vehicles transit, usury, physico-chemical agents and thermal expansion.") what decreased the quality of the paper. The scope of the paper fits well to the scope of the FOSS4G conference, but the writing style and the content is not suitable for a journal publication

Recommendation *

- Strong Accept and recommendation for inclusion in Transactions in GIS
- Strong Accept
- Weak Accept
- Reject

Close

* Denotes required field

