

# Review Form Response

## Review FOSS4G Academic Track Submission

This form is for reviewing a FOSS4G Academic Track Submission.

Remarks to the editors \*

The paper describes an interesting approach to enable and facilitate the use of Open Street Map data in authoritative and professional contexts. Especially the standards based approach is promising to ensure the easy combination with other types of data source.

Although it is stated that there is a research gap that needs to be closed, a more detailed view on the specific research challenges is missing. Within section 2 several requirements are mentioned which cannot be fulfilled with existing tools. However, in this section pure software development tasks are mixed with potential research question. Thus, the paper fails to some extent to precisely state which research gaps are closed by the presented work.

The presented approach of combining open source with proprietary software tools is very positive. This ensures a pragmatic solution which aims for the best possible result. However, the paper lacks a clear separation between the overall conceptual approach and its implementation. It would have been beneficial to separate section 4 into two chapters: first an abstract description of the workflow and system design, and after this a description how this abstract concept was implemented through open source and proprietary software components.

The most important deficit of the paper is that it lacks a critical evaluation of the developed system. Detailed information on aspects such as performance (i.e. quantitative statements) is missing (for example a comparison between Oracle Spatial and PostGIS is described on page 9; however a statement such as "very much better efficiency" is not sufficient for a research paper). Especially for the update mechanism more detailed information about its performance would have been very valuable.

The language of the paper is good. Only a final proof-reading to fix some minor errors is recommended.

Remarks to the author

See "Remarks to the editors".

Recommendation \*

- Strong Accept and recommendation for inclusion in Transactions in GIS
- Strong Accept
- Weak Accept
- Reject

Close

\* Denotes required field

